1 2 3 4 5	JOSHUA P. THOMPSON, Cal. Bar No. Email: jthompson@pacificlegal.org Pacific Legal Foundation 555 Capitol Mall, Suite 1290 Sacramento, California 95814 Telephone: (916) 419-7111 Facsimile: (916) 419-7747	2509	955
6 7 8 9 10	JACK E. BROWN, Va. Bar No. 94680* Email: jbrown@pacificlegal.org Pacific Legal Foundation 3100 Clarendon Boulevard, Suite 1000 Arlington, Virginia 22201 Telephone: (202) 888-6881 Facsimile: (916) 419-7747		
11	Attorneys for Plaintiff		
12	*pro hac vice application forthcoming		
13			
14	UNITED STATES DIS	STRI	CT COURT
15	SOUTHERN DISTRICT	OF	CALIFORNIA
16			
17 18	CALIFORNIANS FOR EQUAL RIGHTS FOUNDATION,	No.	'24CV0484 MMAMSB
19	Plaintiff,		COMPLAINT
20	,		
21	V.		
22	CITY OF SAN DIEGO, HOUSING AUTHORITY OF THE CITY OF SAN		
23	DIEGO, and SAN DIEGO HOUSING		
24	COMMISSION,		
25	Defendants.		
26			
27			
28			
	Complaint		
	- F		

INTRODUCTION

- 1. Housing prices in California are extremely high and San Diego is no exception. To combat the rising cost of housing, the City of San Diego (City) created a pilot program to provide grants and loans to first-time homebuyers looking to put down roots in San Diego. Eligibility for this program is based on an individual's race.
- 2. Plaintiff Californians for Equal Rights Foundation (CFER) has members who are ready, willing, and able to purchase a home in San Diego. But those members are ineligible for a grant or loan under the City's Black, Indigenous and other People of Color (BIPOC) First-Time Homebuyer (FTHB) Program. Because the FTHB Program bases eligibility on race, CFER's non-BIPOC members are categorically ineligible for the assistance.
- 3. CFER brings this action to vindicate its members' rights to equal protection and end the City's racial discrimination. The Fourteenth Amendment's Equal Protection Clause requires the government to treat its citizens as individuals, not as members of a racial group. The Program's race-based measures violate that constitutional command.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 4. This action arises under the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution and 42 U.S.C. § 1983. The Court has jurisdiction over this federal claim under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 (federal question) and 1343(a) (redress for deprivation of civil rights). Declaratory relief is authorized by the Declaratory Judgment Act, 28 U.S.C. §§ 2201–2202.
- 5. Venue is proper in this district under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391(b)(1)—(2). Defendants reside within this district and a substantial part of the events giving rise to this claim have occurred or will occur in the Southern

District of California.

PARTIES

- 6. Plaintiff Californians for Equal Rights Foundation is a nonprofit foundation established to defend the principle of equality under the law in the State of California. CFER engages in policy advocacy, voter education, and empirical research in furtherance of its mission to protect equal rights for all Californians. CFER's membership includes one or more individuals who self-identify as white, who have not owned a home within the past three years. One or more of CFER's members is ready, willing, and able to apply for the FTHB Program, and would be eligible for the program's benefits were race not a factor.
- 7. Specifically, CFER Member "A" wishes to buy a home in San Diego. He self-identifies as white. Member A has not owned a home within the past three years. Member A is part of a household of one and has an income between \$77,200 and \$122,650. Member A is ready, willing, and able to apply for a grant or loan provided under the Program.
- 8. Defendant City of San Diego is a subdivision of the State of California, created and existing by charter promulgated under the California Constitution. The City has a duty to comply with the United States Constitution by not engaging in discrimination on the basis of race.
- 9. Defendant Housing Authority of the City of San Diego is an agency of the City of San Diego and governs the San Diego Housing Commission, including the development and implementation of the Program. The Housing Authority has a duty to comply with the United States Constitution by not engaging in discrimination on the basis of race.
- 10. Defendant San Diego Housing Commission is an agency of the City of San Diego and implements the Program. The Housing Commission has a duty to comply with the United States Constitution by not engaging

in discrimination on the basis of race.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

The San Diego Housing Commission

- 11. The City of San Diego created the San Diego Housing Commission in 1979 to provide housing opportunities for individuals and families with low income or experiencing homelessness.
- 12. One of the Housing Commission's functions is to create and preserve affordable housing through its roles as a lender, bond issuer, administrator of City of San Diego land use programs, and a property owner.
- 13. One of the ways in which the Commission provides affordable housing opportunities is by offering deferred loans and homeownership grants to help low- and moderate-income families buy their first home. In this role, the Commission assists with purchases of single-family homes, townhomes and condominiums in the City.

The Challenged Program

- 14. In June 2023, the Housing Commission launched the First-Time Homebuyer Program for BIPOC Households with middle income. It is a pilot program to help middle-income homebuyers buy a home in San Diego.
 - 15. The program provides benefits in two ways:
 - a. \$40,000 in total assistance, consisting of a \$20,000 deferred loan toward the down payment on a home and a \$20,000 grant toward closing costs; or
 - b. a \$20,000 grant toward the down payment on a home and closing costs.
- 16. Eligibility for the program's benefits is based on race. It provides assistance only to "eligible borrowers who self-identify as black,

- 17. The Commission requires that applicants establish program eligibility through a signed self-certification form in which the applicant identifies his or her race.
- 18. "Strict penalties" may be imposed on an applicant for "making a material misstatement, misrepresentation or fraudulent act on documents submitted to the Housing Commission," including the self-certification form. These include fines and penalties, as well as a ban from applying for or working with Housing Commission programs in the future. Exhibit A at 4.
- 19. If an individual or household who does not self-identify as "black, indigenous or other person of color" applies for the program's benefits, his or her application will be rejected.

CAUSE OF ACTION

(Violation of the Equal Protection Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment, through 42 U.S.C. § 1983)

- 20. Plaintiff hereby realleges each and every allegation contained in Paragraphs 1 through 19 as though fully set forth herein.
- 21. The Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution provides: "No State shall make or enforce any law which shall . . . deny to any person within its jurisdiction the equal protection of the laws." U.S. Const. amend. XIV, § 1.
 - 22. 42 U.S.C. § 1983 provides that:

Every person who, under color of any statute, ordinance, regulation, custom, or usage, of any State or Territory or the District of Columbia, subjects, or causes to be subjected, any citizen of the United States or other person within the jurisdiction thereof to the deprivation of any rights, privileges, or immunities secured by the Constitution and laws, shall be liable to the party injured in an action at law, suit in equity, or other proper proceeding for redress

- 23. Defendants City of San Diego, San Diego Housing Authority, and San Diego Housing Commission are "persons" within the meaning of U.S.C. § 1983. *Monell v. Dep't of Soc. Servs. of City of New York*, 436 U.S. 658, 663 (1978).
- 24. Defendants have acted and are acting "under color of state law" within the meaning of section 1983.
- 25. The FTHB Program discriminates on the basis of race in violation of the Equal Protection Clause.
 - 26. The FTHB Program facially discriminates on the basis of race.
- 27. The FTHB Program is subject to strict scrutiny because it categorizes individuals on the basis of race.
- 28. The FTHB Program's racial classifications do not serve a compelling government interest.
- 29. Defendants have not specifically identified any racial discrimination to be remedied by the FTHB Program.
- 30. Defendants cannot identify any statute or constitutional provision that would be violated in the absence of its race-based FTHB Program.
- 31. Defendants lack a strong basis in evidence to conclude that remedial action is necessary regarding any racial discrimination in the City of San Diego.

34. Plaintiff's members have been and will continue to be harmed by Defendants' racial discrimination.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests the following relief:

- 1. An entry of judgment declaring that Defendants' provision of housing benefits on the basis of race violates the Equal Protection Clause.
- 2. An entry of a permanent injunction against Defendants prohibiting them from continuing to enforce the challenged discriminatory aspects of the Black, Indigenous and other People of Color First-Time Homebuyer Program.
- 3. Entry of an order requiring Defendants to provide housing benefits without regard to the race of applicants.
- 4. An award of attorney's fees and costs in this action pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 1988.
- 5. An award of nominal damages in the amount of \$1.00.

6. An award of any further legal or equitable relief this Court may deem just and proper

based measures.

$_{ m JS~44~(Rev.~04/2)}$ case 3:24-cv-00484-MMA-MSELV procent of 1 Fig. 63/12/24 PageID.9 Page 1 of 1

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS				DEFENDANTS					
Californians for Equal Rights Foundation				City of San Diego, Housing Authority of the City of San Diego, San Diego Housing Commission					
(b) County of Residence of	f First Listed Plaintiff Sa	an Diego		County of Residence of First Listed Defendant San Diego					
(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)				NOTE: IN LAND CO	(IN U.S. PLAINT ONDEMNATION C	TIFF CASES ON ASES, USE TH	VLY)	OF	
					OF LAND INVOL	VED.			
	Address, and Telephone Number, pson, Pacific Legal F			Attorneys (If Known)		10.4.03.40	40 4 5454 4		
	te 1290, Sacramento		6)			'24CV04	484 MMA	MSB	!
419-7111	1200, Guoramonio	, 67 (66) 1, (67	.						
II. BASIS OF JURISD	ICTION (Place an "X" in C	One Box Only)		FIZENSHIP OF P I	RINCIPAL P				
1 U.S. Government X 3 Federal Question Plaintiff (U.S. Government Not a Party)			(For Diversity Cases Only) en of This State		orporated <i>or</i> Print Business In Th		Pefendant) PTF 4	DEF	
2 U.S. Government Defendant			Citize	en of Another State		orporated <i>and</i> Pr f Business In Ar		5	5
				en or Subject of a reign Country] 3	eign Nation		<u> </u>	<u> </u>
IV. NATURE OF SUIT					Click here for:				
CONTRACT 110 Insurance	TOF PERSONAL INJURY	RTS PERSONAL INJURY		5 Drug Related Seizure	BANKRUPTCY 422 Append 29 USC 159		OTHER STATUTES		
120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument	310 Airplane [315 Airplane Product Liability	365 Personal Injury - Product Liability 367 Health Care/		of Property 21 USC 881 423 Withdrawal 376 690 Other 28 USC 157		376 Qui Tar 3729(a)	375 False Claims Act 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a)) 400 State Reapportionment		
150 Recovery of Overpayment	320 Assault, Libel &	Pharmaceutical			PROPERTY		410 Antitrus	st	
& Enforcement of Judgment 151 Medicare Act	Slander 330 Federal Employers'	Personal Injury Product Liability			820 Copyright	ts	430 Banks a 450 Comme		ng
152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans	Liability [340 Marine	368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product			835 Patent - Abbreviated		460 Deportation 470 Racketeer Influenced and		nced and
(Excludes Veterans)	345 Marine Product	Liability			New Drug	g Application k	Corrupt	Organiza	itions
153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits	Liability 350 Motor Vehicle	PERSONAL PROPERT 370 Other Fraud		LABOR 0 Fair Labor Standards	880 Defend T		480 Consun (15 US	ner Credit C 1681 or	
160 Stockholders' Suits	355 Motor Vehicle	371 Truth in Lending		Act	Act of 20		485 Telepho	one Consu	
190 Other Contract 195 Contract Product Liability	Product Liability 360 Other Personal	380 Other Personal Property Damage	<u></u>	0 Labor/Management Relations	861 HIA (139		Protect 490 Cable/S	ion Act	
196 Franchise	Injury [385 Property Damage		0 Railway Labor Act	862 Black Lui	ng (923)	850 Securiti	ies/Comm	odities/
	362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice	Product Liability	\Box ⁷⁵	1 Family and Medical Leave Act	863 DIWC/DI 864 SSID Titl		Exchan 890 Other S		Actions
REAL PROPERTY	CIVIL RIGHTS	PRISONER PETITION		0 Other Labor Litigation	865 RSI (405)	(g))	891 Agricul		
210 Land Condemnation 220 Foreclosure	440 Other Civil Rights 441 Voting	Habeas Corpus: 463 Alien Detainee	/9	1 Employee Retirement Income Security Act	FEDERAL TA	AX SUITS	893 Enviror 895 Freedor		
230 Rent Lease & Ejectment	& Ejectment 442 Employment 510 Motions to Vacate			•	870 Taxes (U.	S. Plaintiff	Act	4:	
240 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Liability	443 Housing/ Accommodations	Sentence 530 General			or Defend		896 Arbitrat 899 Admini		rocedure
290 All Other Real Property	445 Amer. w/Disabilities -	535 Death Penalty	146	IMMIGRATION	26 USC	Act/Rev	Act/Review or Appeal of		
	Employment 446 Amer. w/Disabilities -	Other: 540 Mandamus & Other		2 Naturalization Application 5 Other Immigration			Agency Decision 950 Constitutionality of		
	Other 448 Education	550 Civil Rights tion 555 Prison Condition		Actions			State Statutes		
		560 Civil Detainee -							
		Conditions of Confinement							
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in			•						
Image: Proceeding of the proceeding									
Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity): 42 U.S.C. § 1983									
Brief description of cause: San Diego's Black, Indeginous and Other People of Color First-Time Homebuyer Program violates the Fourteenth Amendment.									
VII. REQUESTED IN CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P. DEMAND \$ CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: JURY DEMAND: Yes X No			nt:						
VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY (See instructions): JUDGE DOCKET NUMBER									
DATE SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD									
Mar 12, 2024 /s Joshua P. Thompson									
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY									
RECEIPT# AN	MOUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE		MAG. JUD	GE		



We're About People



City of San Diego First-Time Homebuyer Program for Middle-Income, Black, Indigenous, People of Color (BIPOC) Households

Guidelines

San Diego Housing Commission 1122 Broadway, Suite 300 San Diego, CA 92101 www.sdhc.org





Real Estate Division

CITY OF SAN DIEGO FIRST-TIME HOMEBUYER PROGRAM FOR MIDDLE-INCOME, BLACK, INDIGENOUS, PEOPLE OF COLOR (BIPOC) HOUSEHOLDS

GUIDELINES

Table of Contents

PURPOSE	
DESCRIPTION	2
PROGRAM ASSISTANCE	2
LOAN TERMS	2
GRANT TERMS	2
ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS	3
SELF-CERTIFICATION	3
ELIGIBLE PROPERTIES	3
MAXIMUM SALES PRICE	4
HOMEBUYER EDUCATION	4
HOW TO APPLY	4
APPFNDIX	6

PURPOSE

This procedure describes the San Diego Housing Commission (Housing Commission) Black, Indigenous and other People of Color (BIPOC) First-Time Homebuyer (FTHB) Program, eligibility requirements, and procedure for submitting applications.

DESCRIPTION

The San Diego Housing Commission, in partnership with the Reinvestment Task Force and supported by Wells Fargo's multi-year Wealth Opportunities Realized through Homeownership ("WORTH") grant, offers a down payment and closing cost assistance program to help BIPOC households earning between 80% and 150% of the area median income ("AMI") with the purchase of a home in the City of San Diego.

This procedure contains the requirements pertaining to the program funding sources as well as the Housing Commission Lending Policy 600.101. The Housing Commission may revise the procedures from time to time, terminate and/or place the program on hold at its sole discretion. The Housing Commission at its sole discretion may make exceptions to any procedure which is not driven by funding source regulations or the Housing Commission Lending Policy 600.101. Additionally, the Housing Commission may require borrowers to provide additional information and/or supporting documentation necessary to determine eligibility for the program.

Funding will be issued on a first-come first-approved basis. Borrower must be under contract for a home purchase.

This program cannot be used in conjunction with other SDHC First-Time Homebuyer programs or the Affordable For-Sale Housing Program. New construction developments are not permitted.

PROGRAM ASSISTANCE

\$40,000 down payment and closing cost assistance [Loan of \$20,000 to be used toward Down Payment, plus a Grant of \$20,000 to be used toward Closing Costs]

OR

\$20,000 Grant to be used toward down payment and closing cost assistance.

LOAN TERMS

Interest Rate: 1.5% simple interest

Term: 15 years

The Loan is deferred with no monthly payments required for years 1 through 7. Beginning in year 8, the outstanding principal and interest will be converted to an amortized loan with fixed monthly payments for a period of 96 months. There is no prepayment penalty, and payments can be made at any time.

The Loan also becomes due if property is sold, leased, conveyed, refinanced, transferred or further encumbered within the 15 years.

Borrowers will execute a Promissory Note, Deed of Trust, and CC&Rs.

GRANT TERMS

The Grant will be forgiven at the end of 3 years if the property remains owner occupied.

ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS

Assistance under this program is for eligible borrowers who self-identify as black, indigenous or other person of color. This includes borrowers that self-identify as Hispanic/Latinx and any race other than white.

Income Limit	80% - 150% AMI (see income limits below)
Maximum Debt-to-Income Ratio	50% (not applicable when applying for the grant only)
Middle Credit Score	640 (not applicable when applying for the grant only)
Down Payment - Minimum	1.5% of purchase price (not applicable when applying for the grant only)
Down Payment – Maximum	25% of the purchase price
Maximum Liquid Assets Reserves	\$50,000
Maximum Liquid Assets within 2 months of opening escrow.	\$90,000

The subject property must be occupied as the primary residence of the borrower. Not occupying the property while the loan is outstanding will result in the principal and interest becoming immediately due along with default interest of 10%. Program participants must notify the SDHC to arrange payoff of their loan prior to moving out of the property or refinancing their first mortgage.

Qualified applicants and all household members over the age of 18 must be a first-time homebuyer. A First-Time Homebuyer is defined as a person who has not owned a home within the last three years. This includes ownership of property in another country. Applicant still meets definition of FTHB if they own a mobile home that is not fixed to permanent foundation.

Subordinate financing at time of purchase is allowed provided the loan is forgiven after a period of time or deferred with no payments required for 30 years. Subordinate financing documents must record after all SDHC loans/grants. Cannot be combined with other SDHC programs.

See the City of San Diego Program Guidelines for Income Calculation and Credit requirements. The Credit, DTI, and down payment requirements are not applicable when applying for the grant only.

SELF-CERTIFICATION

A signed Self-certification Race and Ethnicity Form will be the required method of BIPOC identification for purposes of establishing program eligibility. This form is available for download on the SDHC website. https://sdhc.org/housing-opportunities/first-time-homebuyers/participating-lenders/

ELIGIBLE PROPERTIES

Eligible properties include existing single family detached homes, condominiums, townhomes, and manufactured homes located in the City of San Diego. New construction developments are not permitted.

MAXIMUM SALES PRICE

The Current maximum sales price for attached and detached properties is: \$1,250,000.

MINIMUM / MAXIMUM INCOME LIMITS Effective April 2023

Household Size	Minimum Income 80% AMI	Maximum Income 150% AMI
1	\$77,200	\$122,650
2	\$88,200	\$140,150
3	\$99,250	\$157,700
4	\$110,250	\$175,200
5	\$119,100	\$189,200
6	\$127,900	\$203,250
7	\$136,750	\$217,250
8	\$145,550	\$231,250

HOMEBUYER EDUCATION

All borrowers, and any non-borrowing spouse must **complete Pre-Purchase Counseling AND Homebuyer Education.** These are two different classes, both are required.

Borrower(s) must use a provider on the SDHC approved Homebuyer Education Provider list which can be downloaded from the <u>SDHC website</u>.

HOW TO APPLY

Interested buyers must work with a loan officer from SDHC's Participating Lender List which can be downloaded from the <u>SDHC website</u>. The loan officer will be the primary point of contact from pre-approval to loan closing. The loan officer collects all required documentation and submits the application on the borrower's behalf to SDHC.

Participating Lenders - The BIPOC First-Time Homebuyer program will operate utilizing the same processes as the current low-income (up to 80% AMI) First-Time Homebuyer Program. See the Submission, Processing and Funding section of the City of San Diego Guidelines published on the SDHC website at: https://sdhc.org/housing-opportunities/first-time-homebuyers/participating-lenders/

Penalties for Misrepresentation by Applicant or Lender / Loan Officer

Strict penalties may be imposed on any applicant or Participating Lender making a material misstatement, misrepresentation or fraudulent act on documents submitted to the Housing Commission. Any person making a negligent material misstatement or misrepresentation in any application, affidavit or certification made in connection with the application for the SDHC's programs, shall be subject to all applicable fines and penalties. Any applicant or participating loan officer found to have made a material misstatement, misrepresentation or fraudulent act on documents submitted to the Housing Commission will be banned from applying for or working with SDHC programs.



The San Diego Housing Commission (SDHC) is committed to affirmatively furthering fair housing by promoting fair and equal housing opportunities for individuals living in the City of San Diego. This commitment extends to all housing programs managed or owned by SDHC and to all grantfunded programs provided by SDHC. It is the policy of SDHC to provide services without regard to race, color, religion, national origin, ancestry, age, gender, familiar status or physical/mental disability. For more on our commitment to affirmatively furthering fair housing visit our website at www.sdhc.org

APPENDIX

This form is available for download on SDHC website



SELF-IDENTIFICATION FORM

Race and Ethnicity

First-Time Homebuyer Program

Primary Borrower's Name (First, Middle Initial, Last)	Birthdate (Month/Day/Year)

Invitation to Self-Identify Race and Ethnicity

The San Diego Housing Commission (SDHC) is a recipient of grant funding on behalf of the San Diego Homeownership Equity Project, comprised of community partners, SDHC, and the San Diego City-County Reinvestment Task Force, to expand homeownership opportunities for the region's people of color. SDHC is subject to agreements set forth in grant funding contracts for data collection pertaining to homebuyer demographics, including but not limited to race and ethnicity. In order to comply with these agreements, and to increase the capacity to monitor progress toward the project's mission, SDHC requests participants in the First-Time Homebuyer Program to voluntarily self-identify their race and ethnicity. The information provided will be kept confidential and used in the form of aggregated data for reporting in accordance with federal and state laws, executive orders, regulations, and grant funding requirements. This information may be used to identify supplementary funding resources that might be applicable to you, as determined by SDHC.

your answer to question 1, please also answer question 2.				
Question 1. Are You Hispanic or Latino? (A person of Cuban, Mexican, Puerto Rican, South or Central American, or other Spanish culture or origin, regardless of race.) Yes No				
Question 2. Please select the racial category or categories with which you most closely identify by checking the appropriate box or boxes. Check as many as apply.				
RACIAL CATEGORY (Check as many as apply)	DEFINITION OF CATEGORY			
American Indian or Alaska Native	A person having origins in any of the original peoples of North and South America (including Central America), and who maintains tribal affiliation or community attachment.			
Asian	A person having origins in any of the original peoples of the Far East, Southeast Asia, or the Indian subcontinent including, for example, Cambodia, China, India, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, Pakistan, the Philippine Islands, Thailand, and Vietnam.			
Black or African American	A person having origins in any of the black racial groups of Africa.			
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	A person having origins in any of the original peoples of Hawaii, Guam, Samoa, or other Pacific Islands.			
White	A person having origins in any of the original peoples of Europe, the Middle East, or North Africa.			